

# The Impact of Demolition of the Red-light area in Baina

*A Research Report by Arz*



*Supported by*



Groupe Développement – Active for Life

## *Acknowledgements*

Arz takes this opportunity to express its whole heartfelt gratitude and appreciation to all those who extended their unstinting support directly or indirectly in conducting this study.

Arz is extremely thankful to all those traumatized victims of commercial sexual exploitation who spared time to share their painful experiences with the research team during data collection, and make this report possible. It's a challenging task to gather information on the closely guarded modus operandi of brothel keepers. However, some of the prostituted girls overcame this hurdle to share information with the research team.

Our special warm thanks also go out to those women residing in Baina and Katem-Baina for participating in the research study as respondents to share their experiences and provide information on the impact of demolition in Baina. Arz would like to convey a special 'thank you' to all those children who participated in the research study and shared invaluable information on the aftermath of demolition in Baina. Arz extends a warm thanks also to Ms. Leela, Mrs. Renuka Chalwadi and Ms. Bhimvavva (Arz's staff of children's project "ANKUR") for making the children comfortable and at ease while sharing experiences and vital information with the research team.

The research unit is grateful to, Mr. Vidyadhar Gadgil for analyzing the data and writing the report, Mr. Sushil Kumar for supervising data collection, and to Ms. Juliana Lohar, Ms. Bincy Wilson and Mr. Yellgurdappa Harijan, social workers in the organization, for rendering their timely and crucial support in conducting the research study.

Last, but most importantly, Arz would like to express its deep and sincere gratitude to Groupe Développement (GD) for their financial and technical support without which this study would not have been possible.

## **About Arz**

**A**rz, (a social work organization, working to combat trafficking of humans for the purpose of commercial sexual exploitation, since 1998) undertook the current research study largely to understand the problems, issues, nature and extent of commercial sexual exploitation in a post demolition age. It was after the demolition of a large area of the red light area of Baina, where Arz has been working since its inception, was there a clear need to understand its impact on the affected people and to accordingly reformulate strategies and interventions. We needed to learn more about the fallout of demolition on the sex trade in Goa and the new modus operandi of the erstwhile brothel keepers of Baina.

Evidently, Arz could have to rethink its previous intervention strategies based on the developments in Baina to continue to combat human trafficking. We were also hopeful that the findings of this study could be used by other organizations whose work was affected by the demolition as well as government departments involved in women and child welfare, protection, rescue, rehabilitation and repatriation. Most importantly, the results of the study were to be shared with the affected communities and the agencies in the source states.

Arz's attempts were to suggest social work intervention guidelines to prevent vulnerable sections of the population from being exploited to combat spread of human trafficking for commercial sexual exploitation and to prevent Baina from re-developing into a red-light area. The organization's focus is work on anti-trafficking and prevention of trafficking through five major programs as follows:-

**ANKUR** – Protecting the future

*(Prevention of delinquency, sexual abuse and commercial sexual exploitation of Juvenile)*

**MUKTI** – Fight Against Exploitation

*(Combating human trafficking for the purpose of commercial sexual exploitation)*

**WISH** – Women's Initiative towards Self Help

*(Economic Empowerment of Women)*

**OICE** – Exploring Hidden Truths

*Resource centre for research, documentation, audio-visuals on trafficking of human for commercial sexual exploitation)*

**RABHAT** – A New Beginning

*Rehabilitation of rescued victims at the Government Rescue Home)*

**Contents**

CHAPTER I	.....	<i>Introduction</i>	4
CHAPTER II	.....	<i>Impact of Demolition on Victims of Commercial Sexual Exploitation</i>	11
CHAPTER III	.....	<i>Impact of Demolition on Women</i>	26
CHAPTER IV	.....	<i>Impact of Demolition on Children</i>	33
CHAPTER V	.....	<i>Impact of Demolition on Brothel-keepers</i>	39

Chapter I

## *Introduction*

It is a universal truth that “demolition” (of human settlements), either natural or man made, has always had a devastating effect on human beings. In the case of man-made, demolition, it’s always been justified on the grounds of socio-political development, but the ultimate sufferers of such demolitions are usually the most marginalized and underprivileged segments of society. The current research study is one more attempt to bring to light the impact of demolition on the vulnerable victims of commercial sexual exploitation that occurred on 14<sup>th</sup> June 2004 at Baina, Vasco-da-gama, Goa, India.

### **About Baina Beach & Red-Light Area at Baina**

Baina Beach is the longest and most picturesque beach of the city of Vasco da Gama, it is situated in Mormugao taluka in the district of South Goa, Goa, India. Goa's only organized red-light area commonly referred to as 'Baina red-light area' is located on a part of this beach. It is located approximately 4 kms away from the airport, 2 kms from Vasco railway station and main bus stand. Goa has always been famous for the scenic beauty of its beaches. However, several factors, including certain clauses of the tourism policy and unusual profit motives of vested interests for maximizing profits from Goa tourism, gradually created a negative and sex-based image of tourism in Goa. Historically, the red light area at Baina beach has its beginning in the year 1855. Having had its inception in a port city, the activities of prostitution took root slowly but firmly. Nevertheless, it is only 40-50 yrs ago that the red light area started to take shape in the form of organized brothels. The Baina beach which was considered a piece of paradise by the locals and tourists has today become a centre for commodification/sale of women and girls, with highly influential men and women as marketeers (professional agents), buyers (agents, brothel keepers), sellers, middle men (pimps) and customers. Due to this, public use and social interaction among the people on the beach had stopped in pre demolition age.

Baina has had a population of around 10,000 that included those residing in the red-light area and those residing in the neighbouring slum area. Baina had a mixed population, (i.e. people from Uttar Pradesh, Karnataka and Andhra Pradesh). But the majority of the population belonged to people from Karnataka who had been living in Goa for over three generations. The population consisted mainly of three groups – trafficked victims, traffickers (pimps, brothel-keepers, room-owners) and people who were not connected with prostitution but lived there as rooms were cheaper. The devadasi system was found to be prevalent in Baina among the Kannadigas for many years. The brothel keepers of the red light area especially

those who were from Karnataka encouraged the parents to dedicate their daughters and then sell them for commercial sexual exploitation. A large number of girls from the area have been found to be dedicated and then sold to the brothel keepers in the Baina red light area. While the population in Baina was mainly from Karnataka over the decades, it was in the 90's that girls and women from Andhra Pradesh and later from other states started getting trafficked into the area. By 2004, nearly 80% of the girls and the brothel keepers belonged to Andhra Pradesh.

Before the demolition, Baina beach was a site of dwellings huddled together in an overcrowded, unhygienic environment; the area consisted of gullies, single, windowless rooms, interspersed with brothels - constructed primarily for activities of prostitution, liquor bars, gambling dens and family rooms. The persons/families in the area can be divided into 3 groups according to their role in the community and the dynamics of prostitution:

- Victims of Commercial Sexual exploitation (*prostituted women and girls trafficked from neighboring states of Andhra Pradesh, Karnataka and girls from Baina beach itself*)
- Perpetrators of Prostitution (*including brothel-keepers, most of whom were previously prostituted women, pimps etc.*)
- Persons vulnerable to commercial sexual exploitation (*both adults and children living in the community, shelterless women, widows, wives of HIV positive men etc.*)

### **Trafficking scenario in Pre-demolition Age**

Women and girls have usually been trafficked from various regions in the states of Karnataka, Andhra Pradesh and Maharashtra; these are mostly drought-prone areas or regions affected by natural calamities and areas where there is a paucity of jobs or means for survival. Under conditions, difficult marital circumstances, societal difficulties, religious traditions or family pressures become a major cause for continued trafficking. Baina beach itself was a source area for girls and women supplied to the red light area. A large number of the girls who got trafficked to the red light area for the purposes of CSE were those who were dedicated (devadasis) to Goddess Yellamma. This was prevalent more among the population hailing from North Karnataka; this population comprises 80% of the total population of Baina (including the red light area and the neighbouring slum area).

It was found that the brothel keepers, originally from Karnataka and involved in CSE in Baina, used to go around the Baina slums identifying young girls and then encouraging parents and relatives to dedicate them. It was also found that they used to give loans at a high rate of interest to the families that had young girls and when the latter were unable to repay the loans, force them to dedicate their daughters and sell them for commercial sexual activities. The brothel keepers were so powerful that the community, though unhappy with the dedication and exploitation of the girls from the area, found it difficult to unite and protest against

what was happening.

Baina beach was considered to be an area with one of the highest crime rates in the state. It was a place of refuge for offenders from outside the area, alcoholism, gambling etc that led to greater violence.

Within the family, the male figure could be the biological father, uncle, a step-father, or a 'mard' (a man with whom the mother had a long term relationship without marriage). The men in these families indulge in regular drinking, gambling and sexual relationship with prostituted women. Some of these men survive on the earnings of their daughters. Many of these girls are forced to leave school at an early stage. The children in the community are adversely affected, as they grow up in dysfunctional families and witness the happenings in the commercial sexual exploitation market. A large number of children are dropouts who are expected to play the role of a housekeeper and baby-sitter. The average income of such families is approximately Rs.50 a day. The adult member takes up temporary jobs such as construction labour, painter, maidservant and vegetable vendor. The cost of living is rather high. Due to this, a large number of children, especially girl children and adolescents, were sold into prostitution by their families.

Children are extremely observant and are conscious of the material possessions of one another. It was seen that usually members of families of prostituted women and 'perpetrators' wear better clothes, eat better, and obtain all kinds of things they desire. This is enviously watched by others and desired by them. The constant comparison builds up feelings of differences in status and creates situations of vulnerability whereby children/youth start seeking and following any means to achieve what they desire. They perceive short-term gains as making the most of their life. This often makes them vulnerable to exploitation.

In pre-demolition age, another form of trafficking took place through the prostituted women themselves. Many prostituted women who visit their homes return with other women/girls and introduce them to commercial sexual activities. Some of the girls, especially from Andhra Pradesh, were supplied by the organized trafficking networks in the rural villages of Andhra Pradesh. Traffickers, usually brothel keepers, methodically identified families with adolescent girls having single parents, living on Baina beach or in source states like Andhra Pradesh, Karnataka and West Bengal. They realized their vulnerability and trafficked them for CSE. Some families were forced to give up their young daughters in dedication (according to religious customs) to the goddess "Yellamma". They were thus trafficked for CSE.

The low-risk high profit 'business', corruption, connivance of the members of the law enforcement agencies with the traffickers, state's indifference the issue contributed to the increase in the number of victims of CSE in Baina, Goa.

## **Trafficking scenario in Post-demolition Age**

Over the years, there have been many attempts by the government to demolish the slum area on the pretext of combating commercial sexual exploitation. The area is extremely valuable real estate, and is also being sought by the port authorities for expansion. Attempts at demolition in the past had come to naught, but in June 2004 the Goa government managed to demolish the dwellings in the area.

At seven in the morning of the 14th of June 2004 bulldozers tore through the homes of the women in prostitution and the houses of women, men and children (not connected with the activities of CSE) living in Baina, the red-light area of Goa.

Despite repeated requests by the NGOs, and the Forum for Justice in Baina the government systematically neglected the part of the Hon'ble High Court Order (July 21 2003) that stated the recommendations of the Justice Kamat committee (appointed by the National Commission for Women) be implemented prior to any eviction or 'deportation' of women to their home states. These recommendations clearly state that a proper socioeconomic survey of the whole area should be made and the needs of the women ascertained. If they wanted rehabilitation in Goa or in their home states that must be provided; however, for those who want to continue in prostitution, the area should be notified as 'red light area'.

The authorities also failed to heed the warnings by the NGOs, experts and the National Commission for Women that experience in other parts of India and the world has shown that simply demolishing the red light area will not only fail to eliminate prostitution from Goa, but will lead to the spread of CSE over other areas, where the women will be invisible, inaccessible and consequently vulnerable to abuse, violence, and infections including HIV.

The anti trafficking groups in Goa such as Arz and Forum for Justice in Baina were concerned that the demolition without rehabilitation of the victims and action against the perpetrator would cause further exploitation of the victims. They felt that if the victims are allowed to be in the custody of the brothel keepers they would shift to other areas and continue to commercially sexually exploit the victims in their custody. Arz petitioned the state government and the national agencies such as National Commission for Women and National Human Rights Commission to request the government that instead of focusing on the demolition of houses in the area, the state should identify the victims and the brothel keepers, get the victims freed from the custody of the brothel keepers and initiate action against the brothel keepers. But the state government did not pay any attention and went ahead with the demolition.

NGOs and CBOs like Arz, Positive People, Forum for Justice in Baina, Baina Mahila Mandal and Baina Rahavasi Sangh working in the area had documented and repeatedly reported how the increase in human rights violations and cordoning



# Introduction

off of the red light area by the police since January 2004 had already led to an increase in the number of girls making short trips to lodgings elsewhere in Goa as well as to other red light areas in Mysore, Hubli, Pune and Mumbai in order to survive.

The women reported rapes, forced sex without the protection of condoms, forced sex with multiple partners and increased risk of violence and police raids.

A study considering the health implications of the eviction order was already underway with the full participation of the community. An increase in presentation of symptomatic STIs to the health services combined with a drop in the number of condoms distributed through the NGO programs supported the suspicion that the women were becoming more vulnerable to HIV. Unfortunately the authorities not only failed to heed these warnings based on documents, but even the State AIDS Control Society did not appear to be able to convey the gravity of these concerns to the authorities; in fact the government cynically used the issue of HIV to justify their plans, deliberately misleading the public that the eviction of Baina would remove the threat of HIV from Goa.

Failing to heed any warnings about the adverse effect of demolitions and refusing to involve the NGOs or the community in any rehabilitation plans or plans for the future, the government, (aided and abetted by the Goa State Women's Commission), proceeded to plan the eviction with a complete lack of transparency. Having started to undermine the women through police intimidation and cutting off their source of income through cordoning off the area, they moved on to deceiving the women into registering and making photo identification cards apparently for rice distribution. They finally commissioned an agency to do a socio-economic survey, that was not only unprofessional in its approach, but whose research team members themselves intimidated and threatened the women to accept whatever the State offered them. The only rehabilitation plan that came out of this non-transparent and non-participatory process was the offer of either institutionalisation of the women in a transit camp in Ribander or taking a train back to their state of origin (even though many of the women had been born and brought up in Goa). Incidentally, the state government did not even wait for the survey report commissioned by them and went ahead with the demolition. The report was submitted to the Government of Goa after the demolition.

The indiscriminate way in which the demolition has obliterated the houses and property of families not involved in prostitution, NGO offices, shopkeepers, bar owners, and the hurry and arrogance with which they proceeded to demolish in the middle of the rains, make it obvious that the Goa Government never had the intention of implementing the High Court order of demolishing just 250 cubicles used for activities involving sex, nor did they ever genuinely want to rehabilitate the women. On the contrary it used prostitution and HIV as an excuse to evict the people of Baina; – whether this was driven by ideology or a desire to lay their hands on valuable land, only time will tell. Suffice it to say that in the name of

stopping CSE, the people of Baina, some of the most vulnerable people in Goa (both those engaged and not engaged in commercial sexual activities) have been intimidated, abused, forcibly evicted from their homes in the middle of the rains, and have lost their homes and their property; they have been beaten and arrested for just being there. Women and children were scurrying all around unable to collect their valuables and belongings before their homes were demolished. Others were frightened, confused and without food or shelter – all this in the middle of a heavy downpour. Without food, shelter or a home of their own these destitute women are going to be more vulnerable to pimps and brokers than they have ever been before. In the name of ‘cleansing’ the state of prostitution, the government has abdicated their responsibility of providing protection to the victims of CSE and shelter to thousands of people made homeless.

The government did not bother to rescue the victims from the custody of the perpetrators, take action against the traffickers, or measures for relief before the demolition of the houses in Baina. NGOs stepped into the breach and are still engaged in providing whatever relief they can. It was only after considerable protest from the people of Goa and intervention by the Karnataka Government that some token relief was provided to families not involved in CSE. The state government allowed the traffickers to take the victims and move away from Baina.

The government had made promises about the rehabilitation of the women involved in prostitution who would be displaced by the demolition, but none of these have been honoured. The immediate impact of the demolition was the spread of prostitution, previously limited only to Baina, to other parts of Goa and the neighboring states. The spread has resulted in the victims being more dependent on the traffickers and absence of any kind of protection. The demolition has also forced a large number of vulnerable women into commercial sexual activities.

### **Literature Review**

There have been quite a few studies in India of the phenomenon of trafficking related to commercial sexual exploitation. There are also numerous studies about the situation of women in prostitution, specifically dealing with STD (particularly HIV). Detailed annotated bibliographies on these issues are available at: [http://cira.med.yale.edu/parivartan/resources/reports.html#trafficking\\_0306](http://cira.med.yale.edu/parivartan/resources/reports.html#trafficking_0306). and [http://cira.med.yale.edu/parivartan/resources/reports.html#sexworkhiv\\_0106](http://cira.med.yale.edu/parivartan/resources/reports.html#sexworkhiv_0106).

But very little work has been done on the effects of displacement of women in prostitution specially with reference to the kind that took place in Goa. To our knowledge, there has been only one academic study of the effects of the demolition: Shahmanesh, M. and S. Wayal (2004). *Targeting commercial sex-workers in Goa, India: time for a strategic rethink?* Lancet, 364(9442): 1297-9. Given that this article appeared soon after the demolition, it is more in the nature of estimating the likely effects of the demolition rather than a documentation of the actual effects of the demolition in Baina. But all experts agree that the demolition that took place in

Baina, without any rehabilitation measures, would have an adverse impact on the lives of victims of CSE and also have negative implications in terms of further spread of HIV and extension of commercial sexual exploitation to other parts of Goa.

Newspaper and magazine reports have been a source of material regarding the effects of the demolition in Baina on victims of CSE and the community in Baina. The three main English dailies in Goa – *Gomantak Times*, *Navhind Times* and *Herald* – all carried detailed reports on the demolitions, largely applauding the action, with the notable exception of the *Gomantak Times*, which took a more critical stance. The *Gomantak Times* also did follow up with articles about women in prostitution and members of the community in Baina after the demolition; a number of articles by Preetu Nair covered their travails. The *Goan Observer*, a weekly, published critical articles on the demolition but there was no follow up.

The Marathi press – *Tarun Bharat*, *Goa Doot*, *Gomantak* and *Goa Times* – generally applauded the demolition but did not follow-up on the issue. *Sunaparant*, a Konkani daily, was critical of the demolition without rehabilitation, but again did not follow up.

### **Objective of this study**

Arz has been working towards combating human trafficking for commercial sexual exploitation in Baina, Goa since 1997. After the demolition it was experienced that the demolition had an impact on the phenomenon of commercial sexual exploitation which existed in Baina and on the women and children who resided in the area.

To understand properly the predicament of the victims of commercial sexual exploitation, vulnerability caused by the demolitions, the spread of traffickers operating in Baina after the demolition.

Arz felt that it is important to understand the issue for a proper intervention to protect victims from being exploited commercially, prevent vulnerable women and children from Baina from being trafficked and to prevent the traffickers from setting up their business in Goa. Also to enable lobbying against such evictions and demolitions, and pressuring the State for compensation for the victims.

*These objectives will be achieved through:*

1. The eliciting of information from victims of CSE on the nature of exploitation that they face under the existent forms of prostitution.
2. Involving victims of demolitions in Baina to understand the impact of the demolition in their lives.
3. Locating and tracing the erstwhile brothel keepers (15 to 20) to follow up on the pattern of operation.

This report is intended as a situation analysis report addressing the above objectives.

Chapter II

***Impact of demolition on victims of human trafficking for commercial sexual exploitation***

**Introduction**

*Selection of Sample*

For the study on the impact of the demolition in Baina on victims of CSE, Arz used a list of women in this group drawn up by it during the course of its work from 1997 to the time of the demolition in 2004. A random sample of 31 victims residing in Baina (and being commercially sexually exploited) was considered for the study.

This procedure is likely to have helped the study towards presenting a less gloomy picture of the results of the demolition than is likely to have been the case. Arz's experience has shown that it was the more vulnerable women, who did not have support structures to fall back upon, who were forced to leave Baina after the demolition. The study that follows is therefore presented with this caveat.

*Profile of respondents*

The ages of the respondents ranged from 20 to 35 years; the median age range was 25. Six women were 20 years old; the rest were 23 years and above. Fourteen of the women had received no formal education, four had been admitted to school but were unable to recall when they had dropped out. The remaining 13 women had received varying periods of schooling, with most having stopped well before completing primary school. One woman had completed her Class X. Eighteen respondents were unmarried. Of those who were married, six were below 24 and three above 26. One woman was separated from her spouse. No significant correlation has been found either between age and education or between education and marital status.

A majority of the women (23) were Hindu, seven were Muslim and one Christian. Six were of mixed parentage or belonged to one community but had married into another. Almost all the respondents were Dalits or belonged to other lower castes. Most respondents from Karnataka were dedicated as *devadasis*.

All except five were victims of commercial sexual exploitation at the time of the study. Of these five, four worked in Swift Wash (a laundry unit which is run and managed by erstwhile victims of trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation with supervision and support from ARZ) and one worked as a beautician. The majority of the respondents (12) were from Karnataka; seven of these were born and brought up in Baina and the others were trafficked from Karnataka. There

were 11 respondents from Andhra Pradesh, four from West Bengal, two from Tamil Nadu, and one each from Maharashtra and Uttar Pradesh. Most of the women lived in either extended (14) or nuclear (13) families. Four lived in joint families. Most of the respondents had children and/or there were children in the extended families in which they lived. Most of the children were very young (between one and eight years). The older women, though, had teenage children. Only seven respondents did not have children.

#### *Main Responsibilities*

Most (25) of the women had the sole responsibility of managing the household, from paying the rent to taking care of the day-to-day expenses of the family including food, clothes and medical expenses. All the women with children had the responsibility of taking care of the children which included not just their food, clothing and shelter but also their health and education. They also had to pay for their own travel to places (like Margao, Panjim) where they were sent or went for prostitution after the demolition.

The responsibility for the children places an onerous burden upon the women. Two women paid for childcare expenses when they went on dates (contracts for a fixed number of days with customers for a pre-determined amount) the rest would rely on their families to look after them, or make informal arrangements with neighbours. The welfare of their children was a constant worry for the women. Other responsibilities were no less burdensome. One woman had to pay for the marriage of two brothers and another has the responsibility of getting her niece married as her sister (the niece's mother) has died. Twelve women send money regularly to their families in their native places. In one case the woman was even supporting her *mard's* (pimp's) family. Many of the women are the primary, if not the sole, bread-winners in the family. In some cases they have to take care of relatives in the immediate, joint or extended family. Looking after those who are sick, mentally disturbed, etc. places especial burdens upon the women. Two women had the responsibility of repaying large loans taken at very high rates of interest.

These responsibilities mean that there is considerable pressure on the women to keep earning large amounts of money. This pressure comes from the families, many of whom are in exploitative relationship with the women. This pressure is also self-imposed, since some women themselves feel that they have to shoulder these burdens. Many of the women say that they cannot see any way out of prostitution because of these problems. If it were just a case of managing their own lives and those of their children, that would be feasible, but due to all these burdens they are under pressure to keep earning large amounts, which is only possible through continuing in prostitution.

Despite all these difficulties, the women continue to dream of a better future and make plans for them. Three women have dreams of building their own houses and one of them wants to marry her *mard*. Three women said they wanted to save

money for the future and another that she was working hard now so that her children would get a good education and could then avoid getting into prostitution.

One woman also spent her money on her addiction - alcohol. In only one of the 31 cases was the woman helped by her '*mard*' in running the house by paying for the daily expenses, while in another the woman had only to look after the household tasks as her '*mard*' took care of all the financial needs.

### **What do they do to fulfil these responsibilities?**

Most of the women interviewed (26 of the 31), continue in prostitution due to their myriad problems and responsibilities. One woman had stopped prostituting prior to the demolition and was working as a peer educator, but after the demolition she lost her job (though no clear link between her losing her job and the demolition could be established) and started working as a prostitute again. One woman used to work as a domestic help but after the demolition the added financial pressures forced her to prostitution.

Several women who used to prostitute in Baina moved to other areas after the demolition, both within and outside the state, since it became more difficult to engage in prostitution activity in Baina. Several women also supplement their incomes working as domestic help, pimping, and sending other girls to prostitute on a commission basis. Due to the demolition, they are under greater pressure and therefore at higher risk when meeting their financial responsibilities. This aspect will be explored further in later sections.

Of the five who have given up prostitution, four are working with Swift Wash, and one is a beautician.

### **Which are the places they have moved to for work and what is the situation at these places?**

#### *Within Goa*

Prior to the demolition, most of the women used to take the customers to hired rooms after soliciting them on the road or getting customers through pimps. Some of the women interviewed were prostituting in more than one place (i.e., Baina and elsewhere); after the demolition, the position is such that all of them are forced to prostitute in other places. This leads to increased insecurity as the support structures in other places are grossly inadequate. Some women continue to prostitute in Baina from their own rooms (even if they are staying with a *mard*) or in rooms rented or owned by a brothel-keeper (e.g., the *gharwali* Tara). Most preferred Baina as it was 'safe'. As one woman said, she prostitutes only in Baina as she feels safe there; she feels that no customer can beat any girl or force her to have unprotected sex. 'They can't cheat us here in Baina,' she said. She is afraid of going outside because of the fear of what might happen in difficult situations. Another said that she felt secure in Baina because of the room owners and other women.

“There is no fear of any sort of abuse.”

Women related incidents of young girls and women who had been sent out of Baina to prostitute after the demolition (and even before the demolition whenever business in the red light area was poor). One girl, for instance, was cornered late at night at the Margao bus stand and raped repeatedly by four men who took turns having anal and oral sex with her as well. They forced her to engage in these acts by placing broken liquor bottles, knives and kerosene around her and threatening that if she did not obey they would set her on fire. This girl was physically and emotionally traumatized for weeks after that, after which she returned to her native place in Andhra Pradesh. Instances like these are not uncommon when women have moved out of the relative safety of Baina, where informal networks to protect them do exist. These instances happened both before and after the demolition. Women who have already had bad experiences outside Baina prior to the demolition did not want to go out of Baina after the demolition. Some of them have, however, been forced to go back to prostitution due to lack of choice, and added pressures of earning money.

However, after the demolition, most of the women also go to other places, not just to Margao, but also to Panjim, Vasco, Colva, Mapusa and Calangute. In all these places customers are solicited on the streets, after which they are taken to lodges or hotels; in some cases lodges are arranged for by the customers. The women who go out of Baina complained that they are subject to beatings and harassment by the customers. This was particularly true of lodge-based prostitution in Margao. While some said that the managers provided them some protection when customers got abusive, others said that they had to fend for themselves. One respondent said that in Margao there was no risk in lodges but they faced problems with the police while soliciting on the road.

Organisations in Margao provided them with condoms. One woman who goes to Margao regularly said that she used to be put in a room along with other girls and was made available to customers on demand. All the money was given to the brothel-keeper who had sent her there. She was supposed to pay back huge sums to her brothel-keeper, as she had been sold to her by a friend. Those who solicit on the streets in Margao said that goons abuse them physically and verbally while they solicit. Another problem in Margao is that the women from Baina are unwelcome as it affects the business of those women who have been using Margao as their base for many years. The latter often fight with and prevent other/new girls from prostituting in the area. These conflicts add to the feeling of insecurity and tension.

The main places in Margao where the women prostitute include some hotels and lodges on the road-side in Gandhi Market; these are reportedly clean and safe. (The names of these hotels have not been included in this report.) In these lodges, a few rooms are set aside exclusively for commercial sexual activities. The authorities

seem to turn a blind eye to the goings-on here; probably regular *haftas* are paid. One respondent said that she had sex with drivers, cleaners, and supervisors to supplement her income as a construction worker. She used to go to lodges in Vasco, Colva, and also to the isolated forest areas. One woman who was sent from Baina after the demolition to lodges in Vasco said that if the customers created any problem, nobody would come to her help. If she ran short of money, she would get it from the room-owners at high rates of interest. Another woman said that while she was in Baina, she was with the brothel keeper and therefore was confident of no risk, as the brothel-keeper would ensure security. After the demolition the same brothel-keeper would send her to Panjim for the entire night and she was terrified, as the brothel-keeper did not have any network there to protect her from harm.

Another woman who used to be sent to Panjim said that the girls are kept in one room in a lodge and customers would come to choose the girls and then they would take the girls to lodges. Miramar beach near Panjim is another area where women solicit. Panjim Tourist Hostel is one of the places where women prostitute. Sometimes, customers come to Baina and the women are sent with them to other parts of the state.

In sum, one of the effects of the demolition has been the forcing of women to prostitute in other parts of Goa where no support networks exist. This has placed them at higher risk, and subjected them to even more brutal exploitation. The situation is even worse when they go outside Goa, as we shall see in the following section.

#### *Outside Goa*

Since the demolition, many of the women are sent outside the state to various places on 'dates'. The trips could vary in length from a few days to a few months in some cases. Most of these women have been to various places in Karnataka, including Mundrabad near Gadag (at Renuka Lodge), Hubli, Mysore, Mangalore, Bangalore, and Bellary.

In some cases, women who were sent outside Goa said that 3-4 girls had to share a room in a lodge and when customers came, the selected girls were sent to the rooms of those customers. The money would be given to the owner/manager of the lodge (Rs 500 per customer), who would pay the girls after taking a substantial cut.

Seven of the respondents had been to Mysore, where they were involved in lodge-based commercial sexual activities (CSE). All of them said that the situation in Mysore was good; they illustrated this point with several instances. Food and accommodation were free but other services were chargeable. They said that doctors were sent for when they were sick. One woman said that once she was so sick, that she had to be admitted into the hospital. All her needs were taken



care of by the manager and he did not charge her for this. He even sent female staff to keep her company during hospitalization. There are special rooms in the lodges in Mysore for prostitution. The respondents said that the lodges were very clean and safe. In case of a police raid, the lodge managers provided protection. The police were paid off by the owner. In case of any problem or abuse, the owner took care of everything. In fact, many of the women said that the support structures in Mysore were much better than they had been in Baina prior to the demolition, and that they felt very safe and secure there.

One woman said that after the demolition, she had gone to the Bellary red light area for prostitution while her mard was seriously ill. In Bellary, the rooms were very small with no bed, light, fans, or ventilation. NGOs used to distribute condoms and doctors used to provide 24-hour medical services in emergency cases (such as the breaking of condom in the vagina). The brothel-keepers used to ensure that customers used condoms. While these were positive features, on the negative side, goons used to beat the girls if they did not provide free sex; they would break down the door and come inside. They would beat the girls severely. One respondent had herself experienced abuse: she was beaten up and made to stand naked for hours. Other girls were forced to have sex without condom and haftas had to be given to goons. In Bellary, the customers were brought by pimps and money was given to the brothel-keeper. The customers chose the girl. The brothel-keeper settled accounts with the women on a monthly basis. The brothel-keeper provided shelter, lunch, and dinner; the remaining expenses had to be borne by the women. The financial dealings took place in the absence of the women/girls, so they did not really know what the amount of money that changed hands was.

A few women had gone to Mumbai, Kalyan (Anmon Tikly), Pune, and Tamil Nadu. The respondent who had stayed in Kalyan said that the situation was similar to Baina, where she was prostituting in a single room with her friend. The one in Pune said that the gharwali took care of the health of the women and bailed them out in case they were arrested, as well as provided safety from goons. But barring these few positive features, women going outside Goa had horror stories (similar to the ones mentioned above) to recount. The feeling of insecurity are very high - the risk of violence and unsafe sex being forced upon them, and the risk of being cheated out of their earnings. The demolition had forced these women further into these insecurities and high-risk situations.

### **How do they receive customers, where do they take the customers?**

Almost all the respondents have solicited on the streets as well as depended on lodge managers to get them customers. In Baina, customers roam on the road or wait at the paan shop in the area. Women wait for the customers to approach them and only then do they take further action. Customers are then taken to rented rooms. Presently in Baina, prostitution is carried out independently, where girls

approach room-owners directly and use their rooms for prostitution. Pimps also get customers for the girls. These are the pimps who used to work earlier as pimps in Baina. One respondent said that in Baina (post-demolition) she took the customers to one of the three women who provided rooms for prostitution. One woman worked independently as she had contacts with police. The customers approached her after which she took them to the room. Some women go to lodges in Vasco if pimps get them customers.

Due to the demolition in Baina, prostitution in Baina has become difficult. There are insufficient rooms available for prostitution, so the women often have to go elsewhere with customers, mainly to lodges in Vasco. Some of the organised networks of brothel-keepers have been destroyed. While this may be a good thing in the long run, the fact remains that no provision for rehabilitation of the women was made; so they were forced to continue in conditions of heightened insecurity and risk.

In Margao, a typical scenario can be pictured from the information given by one of the respondents. She waits on the street or roams on the road in Gandhi Market. Customers approach her. She is then followed by the solicited customer till the entrance of the hotel/lodge and the deal is fixed there. First customers pay their room rent (Rs 70) to the lodge in-charge (on the first floor) and then proceed to the room with her. On entering the room the customer pays her her fee. Sometimes customers want to take the women somewhere else, to a lodge or place with which they are unfamiliar. Some women refuse because of fear of problems arising there which they may not be able to handle. Some women sit in bars waiting for customers. Often the manager and other pimps bring customers for them to the lodge.

In Panjim, brokers keep the women in a hotel and supply them to customers according to the choice of the customers. Soliciting also takes place at the KTC bus stand in Panjim, from where the women are taken to the house of the customer or to lodges.

Outside Goa, the respondents said that the customers were the responsibility of the lodge owner and their pimps. In Hubli, Mysore, and some other places it is lodge-based prostitution, where the managers and pimps arrange for the customers. After a woman is chosen, she takes a bus to Mysore from Goa for Rs 350, and phones the manager when she reaches the bus stand there. He picks her up and takes her to the lodge. Another woman who goes regularly to Mysore said that the manager solicited customers for girls. Room boys also send customers to her, and old customers come directly after calling her on the mobile. Customers are entertained only inside the hotel.

In Ilakal and Nalgundi in Karnataka, one woman said that she solicited in *dhabas* or on the road; after this they went to lodges or shacks; the risk in such situations was very high.

In Bellary, customers used to be taken to brothel rooms. Each brothel-keeper has a minimum of 4/5 and a maximum of 15 rooms.

One thing that becomes clear from the women's testimonies is the heightened risk and insecurity of prostituting outside Baina in the post-demolition period.

### **Who are the customers?**

There is a mixed population of customers at Baina – Goans, Kannadigas, Telugus, etc., and sometimes tourists from different parts of India and even abroad. The number of customers has decreased considerably after demolition. Interestingly, it is mainly in Baina that customers offer and sometimes insist that the women drink alcohol. In most other places, the respondents said that the customers only sometimes drank alcohol; rarely was it offered to the women. It was found that people from high-income groups generally didn't come to Baina, not in the pre-demolition period and certainly not after it. By and large, the customers coming to Baina now are familiar persons, many of whom have been customers for some time. News of the demolition has spread, so the number of new customers coming here is relatively low.

Since the women have to prostitute elsewhere in the post-demolition period, the mix of customers has changed, and varies from place to place. Customers in Margao are daily-wage labourers. There are also some middle-class persons, most of them tourists from Karnataka, Kerala, Tamil Nadu, etc. There are many Goan customers as well. Many of the customers are 'alcoholics'; some are drug addicts. In several cases, the women are unaware of where the customers hail from. Sometimes, the customers themselves say that they are tourists, even when they are locals.

In general, customers come from all sections of society and from various groups – married and unmarried, usually aged 20 years and above (including old men), labourers and well-dressed middle-class types, locals and tourists (seasonal). Customers include men from different walks of life: drivers, cleaners, supervisors, tourists, etc. One woman said she sometimes had rich customers, in such cases they took her to a good hotel for sex.

In general, customers used condoms. One woman said that the customers from the construction sites never use condoms and it was difficult to convince them to do so.

In Mysore, the customers are from Bangalore, Kerala, Uttar Pradesh, Mysore, and other parts of India. Mostly customers are in the 20-30 years age group; elderly customers are rare. Many are alcoholics; a few offer the women alcohol and cigarettes, and a few demand unprotected sex.

No clear information was available about the types of customers in other places. All that could be gathered was that they came from all groups, 'similar to those

in other places’.

### **Payment and money issues**

For those who prostitute on a regular basis, the income usually varies between Rs 3000-5000 per month. Usually the gharwalis, pimps and lodge/hotel managers (whoever is involved) get a sizeable share of the women’s earnings. This share ranges from 50 to 75 per cent per customer. For instance, as one woman explained, if the customer paid Rs 200 in Baina, the gharwali would keep Rs 100 and the pimp Rs 50, while she would get the remaining Rs 50. After demolition, when she started prostituting in Margao, the hotel manager kept two-thirds of her income and provided food and lodging. By and large, it does not appear as if there is much significant change in the proportion of the income going to the woman, whether in Baina or outside, pre-demolition or post-demolition.

In some cases in Baina, women are paid directly by the customers and then they give this money to the gharwali. If they are working independently, they give a share to the pimp who has brought the customer. These women take the customers to rooms where they pay Rs 20-30 as room charges. One woman said that in Baina, customers paid her directly, from this she gave 30 per cent to the room owner or brothel-keeper as the case may be. One woman in Baina gets paid directly, the amount being between Rs 200-300 per customer; from this she has to give a share to the gharwali and the pimp. Women are paid either before or after the job. Women often prefer taking the money in advance as they have had experiences of customers leaving without paying. Men who are dressed well are trusted by these women and in these cases they collect the money afterwards. But even in these cases they are sometimes cheated.

Some women who have to repay loans to their gharwalis often get no money at all. Their entire earnings are taken by the gharwalis against the repayment of loan. In these cases, their basic needs are taken care of by the gharwalis and apart from that they manage with the tips from the customers. Payment is sometimes made directly to the brothel-keeper and tips are given to the women. The tips are usually more for anal or oral sex.

In Margao, those prostituting in the lodges have to pay 50 per cent to the lodge owner. Sometimes lodge managers insist on the payment first and only after this do they send the customers to the rooms. Where pimps are concerned, they usually get about 30-40 per cent and another 20-30 per cent goes to the room owner. The women get their share directly, which is at least 50 per cent of the total amount paid by the customer.

To take the case of one woman after the demolition, she charges Rs 70 for every half-hour and Rs 50 extra if they want a little more time. Goa Guest House charges Rs 70 for the room and Royal Rs 100. She earns Rs 300 per day; she goes to Margao to work after finishing her household chores in the morning in Baina.

Money is shared between the brothel-keeper and the lodge owner if both are involved.

In case of lodges in Vasco, most of the women give a share to the pimp and 30 per cent to the brothel-keeper. In Bellary, girls get tips from customers, usually amounting to 10 per cent of the deal. 50 per cent of the income goes to the brothel-keeper and pimp. The respondent who went to Bellary said that she would get her share of money at the end of month. In most cases customers pay as much as a tip as they pay the brothel-keeper.

In Mysore, the manager takes the money from the customer. The women get tips – (in one case even a gold ring) –from the customers. One woman said that in Mysore she got 50 per cent of the total amount that the customers paid. Per customer she gets Rs 150. She earns Rs 10000-15000 in 15 days in Mysore.

One woman who prostitutes in Ilakal and Nalgundi in Karnataka gives 50 per cent of her earnings to the *dhaba* owner, who provides her with food and shelter. In Pune, the *gharwali* takes 50 per cent of the share of income.

All these arrangements have to be made since the standard arrangements in Baina fell apart after the demolition. Surprisingly, though, it cannot be said that women face greater exploitation in terms of percentage of income going to middlemen after the demolition.

### Forms of abuse

While there was abuse in Baina prior to the demolition, it was relatively low. One respondent said that there was a time in Baina when pimps in the area forced her even when she did not want to. One woman had a customer who ran away with all her money. Once she was beaten when she did not remove all her clothes on being asked to do so.

But the insecurity of the post-demolition situation has led to greater incidence of abuse outside Baina, where women now have to go more often than earlier. In the hotels and lodges in Margao, customers use abusive language and beat the women badly. In such cases, the women call the manager who comes to their rescue. Often, customers force women to drink. Some of the women have thus got addicted to alcohol since their days of prostituting in Baina. New customers don't force the women to consume alcohol. Most women said that customers behave much more rudely or aggressively when they have had alcohol. They sometimes bite them or beat them. Again the lack of support networks outside Baina means that such incidents are more frequent.

One woman said that she used to make clear to the customers what she would do before making the deal. As a result she was never abused. In the case of lodges, the manager would rush to help if the woman screamed or made a noise.

Local goons usually don't pay, and the women have to submit for fear of reprisal or other problems which these goons can create. In one instance, a woman was forcibly taken by a goon and he did not pay.

In most cases customers use condoms; the women refuse them if they want to have unprotected sex. Another woman said that nobody forced her to have unprotected sex, but customers had to be constantly reminded about using condoms. Five women said that they are forced to have sex without condoms and that they were forced to agree (the number of such cases may be higher). It is likely that the women did not want to admit to the interviewers that they engage in unprotected sex, since there is heightened awareness of the dangers of HIV/AIDS. Many customers offer to pay more if allowed unprotected sex.

Many customers demand oral and anal sex. In case of refusal, the women are sometimes beaten. Those who do not have the 'protection' of *gharwalis* may not be paid by the customers at all, some of whom sometimes calmly walk away after sex.

Many customers ask the women to remove all their clothes and to perform different types of sex. One woman related her experience with a customer (more than 60 years old) who used to stay with her all night and bring pornographic photographs of nude girls, and make her try different sexual positions. Once she was sent out of Vasco with one customer by her brothel-keeper from Baina. After reaching the site, she found 10 customers waiting for her. After three customers she refused to take any more. They refused to pay her – after repeated requests she was given Rs 20 rupees to get back to Vasco. Another woman had a similar story to tell – customers had asked her to remove all her clothes, asked for a full night and demanded different types of sex. Customers usually pay after the 'job'. Twice it had happened that she was not given money; the pimp also did not pay her and threatened that he would inform the police about her being a prostitute if she informed anyone of the incident.

When girls go to lodges in Vasco, they face a great deal of sexual harassment. They are made to perform sex in different positions. There is a lot of demand for anal and oral sex by customers in the lodges. Sometimes customers pay only for one person but there are 4-5 customers. One woman said that her friend was beaten badly by a lodge owner in Panjim. Another faced sexual harassment, and had to perform unpaid sexual acts in a hotel in Miramar, Panjim. Some customers ask for different types of sex and they take medication for enjoyment, though it is not very clear what the respondent meant by this.

One woman who used to go to Gadag, Mysore, and Poona said that it was risky there. The customers would bite her and there was no medical care in case of sickness. A woman who went to Bellary was forced to have sex with a goon without any payment. She also said that other women in Bellary were forced to have all types of sex. Some respondents shared experiences of their friends who had been

cheated, robbed and beaten when working outside Baina and in other states. Such incidents were much less in Baina prior to the demolition.

In Mysore, there are many hippies who ask for girls but few girls go with them because they harass them a lot.

In rare cases do women have strong negotiating spaces as they used to have in Baina. For instance, one woman said that no customer made any demand. She made them use condoms and leave the place immediately after the completion of the 'task'. Customers paid her directly for her services as well as room charges. Before taking customers she judged them; if she felt that they were not nice people then she would send them away. Another woman informs her customers that she is HIV-infected when they demand unprotected sex; as a result, they agree to use condoms. Such cases are rare – by and large the women are in a vulnerable position and in no position to negotiate on these matters, often having to put up with various unacceptable suggestions.

### **Who are the other people who don't pay for any form of sexual act?**

When a new girl comes to Baina then the pimps have sex with her without payment. No new girl has come to Baina after the demolition. Once the girl is known, then no one has free sex. In Baina, cases where customers escape without paying are rare, but in both Baina and other places the police do not pay for services. *Mards* do not pay. In Mumbai there are many people who do not pay for sex. These include goons, pimps, police, room owners, etc. – in fact, some of the women interviewed felt that the network of exploitation in Mumbai was so large that they suffer more there.

### **Who are the people who take a share of the income?**

*Gharwalis*, pimps, motorcycle pilots, lodge/hotels owners or managers, mards and in some cases room boys and police are among the people who take a cut from the income of the women. As mentioned, it cannot really be said that the situation has become worse in this regard after the demolition, except in one or two places like Mumbai where the women really suffer.

### **Are there instances where victim faced beating or unpaid and undesirable sexual acts at home, in the neighbourhood or surrounding areas? What are the situations where she faces verbal abuse?**

The respondents often face verbal abuse by customers, people who see them on the road and the police when they are arrested. Again, prior to the demolition, support networks were stronger, so women had to face less of this. A few women are abused verbally and physically by their *mard*. One woman said that her neighbours

kept abusing her and her children verbally without any reason. One respondent said that the *gharwali* in Baina had beaten her with brooms and *chappals* and burnt her hand and thigh when she refused to take customers. Another said that her *gharwalli* in Baina abused her verbally and physically. She was not paid, denied food, and chilli powder was put in her eyes. All these incidents took place before the demolition.

Several respondents said that they are verbally abused by health staff, including doctors, when they go for health check up. Another said that she faces verbal abuse when she goes to the *balwadi*, shopkeepers, other pimps, hotel owners, hospital nurses, during marketing or outside Baina. In fact, the experience of Arz in these matters is that women commonly have to face abuse, both for being 'outsiders' and for being prostitutes. The lack of support networks after the demolition means that they are more dependent on public services, where they face greater abuse for these reasons. Arz has also found that the demolition had made Baina even more notorious than it was earlier, and greater notoriety meant greater levels of abuse.

### **Perception about the police**

Most of the women said that they were afraid of the police, whether or not they had encountered them or had any problems with them. In general, the respondents said that the police were very abusive, both physically and verbally. Many of the women have been beaten for soliciting. During their rounds, the police sometimes swing their *lathis* (wooden sticks) in the air and women often get hurt; many of them feel that the policemen do this deliberately. They run here and there to protect themselves. Many of the women have been arrested and some imprisoned. They also said that if they pay the police, they can avoid getting beaten. One woman said, 'If we bribe them (Rs 100 per week) then they don't harass us. If we are caught in the room then we have to pay Rs. 500.' This situation has changed to some extent after the demolition.

Again, following the same pattern, the police in Baina do not harass the women in Baina as they do elsewhere. This means that the scattering of the women after the demolition has led to greater incidence of abuse at the hands of the police.

Respondents said that about a quarter of the police in Margao abuse the girls sexually and do not pay anything. If the police have good relationship with certain *gharwalis*, and they are properly paid off, the women under them are not harassed. The police also take commissions from some women as well as from the customers.

Some women felt safe with the police. One woman was helped by the police when she complained of her *mard's* physical and verbal abuse. In some cases the women said that the police would inform them before raids so that they could hide in their rooms. In one case, a respondent said, 'They don't trouble us when we go out, but if they see us with a customer they slap the customer and ask him to



leave.' The respondent who frequented Bellary said that the police were very nice in Bellary. The women did not face any problems with the police there. In fact, they used to instruct the girls to hide in the fields at the time of raids.

But this is more the exception than the rule. Generally it is found that the police do not miss out on any opportunity to harass the women and extract money and sexual services from them.

### **Who are the persons and who patronizes prostitution?**

In general it is the nexus between *gharwalis*, pimps, hotel/lodge owners/managers, *mards*, motorcycle pilots and traffickers which perpetuates prostitution. This nexus also makes it difficult for women to give up prostitution themselves. One woman said that she felt that it was due to unemployment that girls prostitute. She said that brothel-keepers, pimps and police are the people who ensure that prostitution is carried on so that they have an income. In Baina the nexus of brothel-keeper, pimps, room owners and police respondent perpetuate prostitution. One woman said that she felt that the brothel-keeper played the most important role in the life of girls who prostitute. They provide all kinds of security and support in crises. Another said that without police support no girl could prostitute. Two women said that parents and relatives were the ones who got the girls into prostitution.

Outside Baina, the women fall into the clutches of networks with which they are not familiar and end up being exploited in a far worse fashion than in Baina, either before or after the demolition.

### **Does she know other girls and women who are also in the business of prostitution?**

Most of the respondents knew 2 to 7 women who were in prostitution; those in Baina knew many more. But the scattering of women after the demolition meant that they had to lose touch with many of the women, thus weakened their support networks. As far as those with whom they are still in touch are concerned, the women could give even their names and in most cases, the addresses where they could be contacted. They also said that after the demolition many of the women from Baina had shifted to other areas in and outside the State. In these cases they did not know where the women had gone. One respondent said that there were 47 women prostituting in Margao (only some were from Baina who had moved to Margao after the demolition; the rest were from elsewhere) but she did not know all of them.

### **Recommendations:-**

- The Central Government need to formulate a national policy for the protection and rehabilitation of victims of commercial sexual exploitation.
- Mass action such as raids, demolition, ban to be avoided.

- The state government needs to be sensitive while taking any action pertaining to the victims of CSE. The approach needs to be of protection and rehabilitation of the victims and punitive action against the traffickers and perpetrators.
- There should be no lower caste discrimination of victims based on age, region, religion, caste and nationality while providing protection and rehabilitation.
- The victims of commercial sexual exploitation from Baina need immediate rehabilitation and compensation.
- The Baina Rehabilitation Scheme, formulated by the state government for the victims of demolition to be implemented immediately.
- The State Government needs to act against the traffickers involved in the commercial sexual exploitation of victims of trafficking from Baina.
- The Police with the assistance of local NGO's and CBO's ensure that the activities of CSE do not increase in Baina.
- The licences of bars operating in Baina involved in perpetuation of CSE need to be cancelled.
- Action to be taken against persons in Baina providing their premises for soliciting and CSE activities.
- The brothels operating in Baina need to be sealed.
- Inquiry needs to be conducted by the Magistrate to check persons involved in CSE and family members surviving on the earnings of the victim of CSE in Baina, followed by penal action.
- The law enforcement agencies to assist Arz in mobilizing the victims to join **Swift Wash** – an economic rehabilitation programme for victims of CSE and to protect those joining Swift Wash.

Chapter III

## ***Impact of Demolition on Women***

### **Selection of the Sample**

A sample survey was conducted from the list of women in the area available with Arz. The names of those in prostitution were effaced, and 44 women were selected at random from the remainder. Only those women who continued to reside in Baina were included – those who had left Baina after the demolition were not included in the sample.

### **Demographic profile of the women**

The age variation in the sample ranged from women in the age group of 20-50 years. 16 were between 20-28 years; 19 were between 30-38 years while nine were between 40-50 years. The majority of the women had very little formal education. 33 (75 per cent) had never been to school; the remaining 11 (25percent) had been to school but dropped out at the primary level or after completion of their eighth standard; not a single woman had studied beyond this level.

#### *Marital status*

Out of the total number of respondents two had never been married, others had all been married at some point of time. Our data shows 13.6 percent (6 respondents) had been separated or divorced and 15.9 percent (seven respondents) were widowed. The husbands had died due to alcoholic intoxication and other health related problems like STDs, others died due to accidents while under the influence of alcohol. Many of the widowed or separated respondents were currently in steady relationships with *mards*. Some considered themselves married to these *mards*, although there were no legal bonds. Some *mards* were in fact legally married to women other than the respondents.

The overall profile of the women in terms of relationships clearly indicates that they were vulnerable to prostitution.

#### *Religion*

Among the 44 respondents 29 were Hindus and the rest were Muslim.

#### *Occupation*

Ragpicking was the most common occupation, with 19 respondents involved in this activity, earning about Rs 40-100 per day. One woman worked in the Mormugao Municipal Corporation, where she earned Rs. 1800 per month. Other occupations in which the women were involved included vending - vegetables, flowers, rotis, etc (7), working - as housemaids (6), in hotels (4), as labourer (2), and in an NGO (1). Four respondents were housewives and were not employed.

Vending fetched these women anywhere between Rs. 25-100 per day. Those working as maid-servants earned Rs. 800-1500 per month, whereas those working in various capacities in hotels earned Rs. 1500-2300 per month. The woman working in an NGO earned Rs. 1500 per month

#### *State of origin*

Majority of our respondents (42) hailed from Karnataka; the remaining two were from Uttar Pradesh.

#### *Family structure*

Most of the respondents (28) lived in nuclear families. 10 respondents lived in joint families and the remaining six in extended families.

Almost all the respondents had children. The average number of children per woman was 2.7. The children had all been sent to school when they reached school going age, but in many cases they had dropped out either at the primary or middle school level. Usually, this was due to financial stringency, and the need to earn money for their family.

### **Description of new developments after demolition**

Women who have had a history of prostitution in the family have been more vulnerable to commercial sexual exploitation (CSE), both before and after the demolition. They could be relatives who were in prostitution, including some who have been dedicated, relatives who were brothel-keepers or husbands who were involved in prostitution as pimps, etc. Besides, many of their husbands were alcoholic and had relationships with prostituted women. Several were also into gambling. The respondents were physically and verbally abused by their husbands; they also had to support their husbands financially. Even in cases where husbands earned, they spent their money on alcohol, gambling and/or prostitution and rarely gave money to their wives to run the household. Many of the respondents were in sexual relationships with other men even prior to demolition. Many of the women who have had problems with their husbands, or after the death of their husbands, have entered into relationships with other men. Usually these were steady relationships, though in most cases the women have not remarried. Sometimes because these men are already married. Several of the women also have relationships with other men in exchange for money, though they are not into regular, organised prostitution. Some women were in extra-marital relationships; when their husbands found out they left them.

The demolition has affected personal relationships badly, worsening the situation in already dysfunctional households. The economic hardships resulting from the demolition (see below) have rendered women more vulnerable.

The economic status of women and their families after the demolition has worsened. One woman who used to sell vegetables, coconuts, etc., and kept goats, suffered

after the demolition. Now she has to go out of Baina to sell vegetables. All the goats were sold after the demolition, as the children had to be sent back to her village. This deterioration in the economic condition of the women after the demolition clearly makes them more vulnerable to commercial sexual exploitation. This becomes clear from the perusal of some of the cases of women who have been affected.

One woman, whose mother and aunt were earlier in prostitution and were *gharwallis* (*brothel owners*) renting rooms for 6 years prior to the demolition, got into a relationship with a man after the demolition. She was pressurized to work as her husband had left her and she was dependent on her aunt and cousins. As her mother's income reduced after the demolition, this woman was pressured to earn through prostitution and finally started prostituting outside the area. Another woman was dependent on her two daughters who were in prostitution; their income reduced after the demolition and she had been forced into ragpicking. She also occasionally takes customers for sex when she goes for ragpicking. Another woman who worked as a housemaid in the red-light area and was paid Rs 100 per day, now gets Rs 2000 per month working in a hotel. Overall, the women stated that the demolition had affected them adversely so far as their economic conditions are concerned.

While the demolition has caused economic hardships to families, especially to women, in most cases it does not seem to have pushed women into prostitution if they were not in it earlier, though it does appear to have made them more vulnerable. However, there were four instances (apart from the two mentioned above) where the demolition had clearly resulted in women entering prostitution. Here again, there was some history of prostitution in the family, making the women vulnerable.

Apart from the two case mentioned above, one of the respondents whose husband had relationships with prostituted women, and who was earlier a vegetable and fruit vendor in Baina, had to go to other places in Vasco after the demolition to sell her goods. She said that men paid her more attention and showed concern in those places and she started getting into sexual relationships with them for money. Another woman's husband had relationships with prostituted women, drank and gambled, forcing her to support the family which she did by selling *papads*, *channa* and eggs and through begging in Baina before the demolition. Her children also begged and stole. After the demolition, since she could not earn a livelihood in Baina she started going out to work as a housemaid where she started getting into relationships with men in exchange of money. A third respondent was earning a good living managing an ironing shop while her husband managed a cycle repair shop, both of which were set up by her husband with the support of a prostituted woman with whom he had a relationship (and who later died). After the demolition in which the shops too were demolished as well, she had to go out of Baina to work as a housemaid and in hotels and lodges. There she got into prostitution as

well. A fourth respondent, whose husband was a pimp and had fallen ill around the time of the demolition, got into prostitution only after the demolition when she had to go outside the area for ragpicking.

There are women who have got into steady relationships with one or two men after the demolition. This is either because their husbands died around that time, or they were separated from their husbands (one or the other had to go out for the entire day to work), or men befriended them during their times of economic hardships.

There are also some cases where women who were earlier in prostitution started ragpicking after the demolition. This too seems to be coincidental with other factors (apart from the demolition) like getting into steady relationships. There are also cases where the husbands/*mards* of the respondents stopped visiting prostitutes after the demolition, due to economic problems.

There are many women whose husbands died, after which there was pressure on them to support families. This period in some cases coincided with the demolition. Therefore, it could be said that the demolition compounded the already difficult situation in which some of the women were placed. For example, one widow whose *mard* died at the time of the demolition had no one to take care of her since she had lost her source of livelihood (washing clothes) as well. She started letting her rooms out on rent to single men. Gradually she started getting into relationships with these men as well as with others outside the area where she went to sell *rotis*.

The demolition has also resulted in increasing economic pressures on those who earned their livelihoods in Baina. One ragpicker said that she now had to go further away from Baina, since after the demolition the number of ragpickers in Baina has increased. Also, the amount of scrap iron available in the area has decreased after the demolition, so the ragpickers earn less there; they are forced to go to places further away from Baina.

Many of the women who are ragpickers are also into stealing, gambling and are addicted to *gutka* or alcohol. This was both prior to and after the demolition. Many of their young children also build relationships with the women, and are involved in gambling, stealing and drinking.

In exchange for the scrap collected by them, the ragpickers earn, on an average, Rs 50 per day. Some of them have get into sexual relationships with men in exchange for scrap iron, plastic or money.

In some cases, after the demolition, children of these women have been affected. One woman's son stopped ragpicking and started anti-social activities with other youth in the area – stealing, pimping, gambling and having relationships with girls. Her other son dropped out of school after the demolition and started ragpicking and stealing. In many cases, daughters of the respondents got into sexual relationships

after the demolition, as there was less control over their movements, as the mothers were away earning a living.

## **New developments in the area after the demolition and their impact**

The respondents felt that there had been a lot of change in the area after the demolition. Some of the changes they noticed included eve-teasing by local boys and community members, increase in girl-boy relationships, increase in girls/boys/women/men having affairs and extra-marital relationships, increase in boys and girls running away from home. They also felt that rape cases were on the increase as women were now more vulnerable. Men exposed their private parts and often approached women (not in prostitution). Previous customers still continued to visit the area; since the sex trade was no longer active here, they sexually harassed local girls.

There are now many instances of open sexual acts on the seashore and behind houses at night. These acts include kissing, touching bodies of girls, watching of sexual acts through windows, as well as sex between women and the customers on the road at night. The open sexual acts are not only confined to commercial sex, but are common among young boys and girls who are in relationships. The dislocation and disruption caused by the demolition, it is felt by many respondents, to be responsible for all this. The social set-up was disrupted considerably, and existing relationships suffered; all this impacted adversely on the people and there emerged a tendency to get into dysfunctional relationships.

All people living in the area were affected by the demolition. Vendors, housemaids, shopkeepers, and people providing a variety of services in the area lost their sources of income when the area was demolished. These people had to find different ways to survive, some who were vulnerable to prostitution, succumbed, others ventured into other areas like ragpicking for survival. A few went back to their native villages. Those already in prostitution started moving to other parts of the state where the demand for sex workers continued to prevail.

The demolition has also affected the children – there has been an increase in school dropouts, increase in stealing, young boys indulging in smoking, increase in gambling and alcoholism among the youth.

The decrease in the business of prostitution has led to economic pressure on the family.

Some respondents said that there has been a decrease in alcoholism among women and the incidence of prostitution in the area has decreased.

## **Experience of heightened discrimination after the demolition**

Many of the respondents have experienced abuse, both physical and verbal after the demolition. This includes calling of names, teasing, pulling at sarees, groping

them when passing by, following them after work, etc. As mentioned in the section on prostituted women, the breakdown of existing social networks has reduced the people's sense of security.

Many women are teased by the youth of in the locality and customers who still come to the area. They have been made offers for commercial sex as well as for relationships with men. Some men offer money and drinks for sexual relationships. Others offer women scrap material in exchange for sex. One woman who refused was gang-raped. The same woman was being continuously made to suffer by a policeman who used to expose his genitals when she went to urinate. Despite a verbal complaint, no action was taken. Other respondents heard reports that sexual favours were demanded from women who were taken to the police station when they were caught stealing. Women who were involved in ragpicking were threatened by men that they would report them to the police if they did not have sex with them.

### **Police response**

There were mixed responses from the women about the police. Many of them did not respond as they did not have any particular views on the subject. Many said that there were no differences before or after the demolition. However, on the whole the perception of the police after the demolition was more positive and many respondents felt that the police security was good; they were stricter and did their work honestly unlike before. Some said that before demolition, the police used to make frequent visits to the area, but this had reduced after the demolition. Others said that the police had started caring more for the people after the demolition. They helped in settling family matters, they have controlled stealing and gambling in the basti. One woman said that the police presence was helpful as they roam in the *gallis* and sometimes advise the women not to sit on the roadside because the area was unsafe.

Others said that before the demolition, the police used to beat and harass the people without reason but after the demolition they had become strict and helpful.

A few respondents, however, said that the police behaviour was worse after the demolition. They visited the area but do not do much. They simply roamed the area and went away. The police it is said, are irresponsible and do not take action against anti-social elements. Thus they cheat the public.

Some responses were based on personal dealings that the respondents had with the police. For instance, one respondent said that before the demolition the police were good but not now, because they arrested her son and beat him without any reason. Another respondent said that she was very angry with the police because once they had arrested her brother.



## **Support from NGOs/others**

A majority of the respondents received some form of support, mainly from NGOs, immediately after the demolition. This support was given for them to tide over the crisis and included food/ rations, clothes, medical aid, school books. Food and clothes were given by Arz and, El Shaddai; several individuals also helped in their personal capacities; one respondent said a minister from Karnataka gave food and clothes, while another got help from a religious organisation.

On a more regular basis, once immediate needs were taken care of, most of the respondents spoke about the support received from Arz. This included medical help for children, school material, counselling services, tuition services, 'exposure' visits, training in income generating activities and vocational training,

Some respondents were also helped by Arz to make affidavits as documents had been lost during the demolition. A few respondents were helped with school admissions for their children. Respondents were helped by Arz to access services from other organizations, e.g., Freedom Foundation and the government health services. Some were assisted in getting jobs; a couple were provided legal aid. Some of the respondents' children were able to avail of educational opportunities through the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan.

## Chapter IV

# *Impact of Demolition on Children*

### **Demographic profile of the respondents**

The sample consisted mainly of girls, who were selected at random from the list available with Arz. 52 girls were selected in all. The age range of the girls was between 9 and 17 years with a median of 12. 38 girls were between the ages of 11 and 13.

Of the 52 girls interviewed, 10 had never gone to school. 15 were studying at the time of the interview, in classes ranging from Std. I to IX, largely depending on their ages, while the rest had dropped out. 18 of those interviewed were rag-pickers (of which 3 were also studying). 8 girls stayed at home, 6 worked as housemaids, 2 as shop attendants and 1 as a construction labourer.

All were unmarried. The majority (49) were originally from Karnataka, though most had been born and brought up in Goa. One each was from Maharashtra, Uttar Pradesh and Nepal. 27 girls lived in nuclear households, 15 in extended families and the remaining in joint families.

20 boys had also been selected randomly for the study. They ranged in age from 11 to 18 with a median age of 14. Ten had never been to school and four had dropped out. Those who were not studying spent their time hanging around in the area (6), four were pimps, three were ragpickers and three were employed as construction labourers. None of them were married. The parents of the majority were originally from Karnataka; one each came from Goa, Andhra Pradesh and Kerala. 12 lived in nuclear households and eight in extended families.

All the respondents came from very poor families, as is evident from the occupations of their parents or guardians. These included ragpicking, daily wage labour, construction work, prostitution, vending, working as motorcycle pilots, shop assistants, etc. In 80 per cent of the cases there was a history of prostitution in the family. This could be mothers who were in prostitution (including those dedicated), mothers who were primarily ragpickers but sold sex in exchange of scrap materials, relatives who were in prostitution, brothers or fathers who were pimping, etc. Educational levels of the parents were low and alcoholism levels were high. Most of the respondents had several siblings; there were an average of 4.1 children in each family.

Interestingly, there was not much difference between the boys and girls in terms of the presence of supervision at home. On the whole, there was partial supervision by parents or other adults; 7 girls and 3 boys had no supervision by adults while 4 girls and 1 boy were highly protected by their parents so that their exposure to

external influences in the community was reasonably restricted.

### **New developments after the demolition making girls/boys more vulnerable to sexual abuse and CSE**

There seemed to be a clear pattern that showed some new developments after the demolition, which made the children more vulnerable to sexual abuse and commercial sexual exploitation. Further, there were some patterns which got accentuated after the demolition. One area where a majority of the children noticed a change was that sexual acts were taking place in open areas, or at least in places where the children could see – these ranged from commercial sex on the roads, the beach or in lanes (especially at night), public display of physical closeness, and in seven cases children witnessed their parents (or mother and *mard*) or guardians having sex in front of them in the same room where they lived. One of the main reasons for this is the lack of space after the demolition as the houses had been broken down, and large families were often confined to smaller places/rooms (that they had taken on rent). This enforced physical closeness created new kinds of pressures.

A second noticeable new pattern that emerged was that many of the girl respondents (86 per cent) had either been approached personally by customers or were abused by them in words or by touch or by exposing their bodies to these young girls. Eve-teasing, wolf-whistling, luring the girls with goodies, and even attempts to catch the girls and take them into the rooms were forms of exploitation that started manifesting themselves after the demolition. Some of the customers who used to come here for sex prior to the demolition continued to do so. On finding that sex was not so easily available after the demolition, they would try to molest the young girls in the area.

There were certain patterns of exploitation which existed prior to the demolition but got heightened later. The respondents felt that there was an increase in the relationships between girls and boys. Of those interviewed, 72 per cent of girls and 83 per cent of boys had sexual relationships, usually with their boyfriends or girlfriends of similar ages, but in the case of 5 girls in exchange for gifts/money as well. However, of the total numbers who were in relationships, a majority (of the older children) had these experiences prior to the demolition as well. It was difficult to get a clear estimate as most of them could not relate their relationships to specific time periods, i.e. prior to or after the demolition. Getting into sexual relationships at a very young age seems to be a common pattern in the area.

However, a clear trend observed was that those with a history of prostitution in the family were far more vulnerable to getting into relationships than others where there was no such history. Typically, it was also seen that these relationships were generally disapproved of by the parents/ guardians of the girls, whereas in the cases of the boys there was only a mild disapproval, if at all. The responses of the girl's parents were mixed, however. In 63 per cent of the cases, the parents tried

to break off the relationship by restricting or increasing supervision of the girl's movements. In the other 37 per cent of cases, she was threatened with dedication into prostitution to dissuade her from the relationship. Close relationships with boys were seen as a threat, since the reputation of these girls was at risk. In the latter cases, all the mothers/aunts were already dedicated and saw this as the only option for their daughters. This does not mean, of course, that all the women who were dedicated wanted the same life for their daughters. But the increased economic pressures after the demolition have certainly increased the risk of the girls being dedicated.

At least six girls were clearly at risk of religious dedication as their mothers/aunts were dedicated and had already suggested that they would dedicate their daughters. In the case of two girls, the mothers threatened that they would dedicate their daughters as they were in relationships with boys and wanted to get married to them.

Of the 52 girls and 20 boys interviewed, 24 and 7 respectively said that there was an increase in the number of affairs of their family members. This included their observations that their parents (or aunts/uncles) had more relationships with women or men (as *mards* or keepers) than before the demolition, or more commercial sexual relationships than earlier. This refers less to women who were in prostitution and more to those in other professions, especially in ragpicking where their main income through ragpicking was supplemented by sex in exchange for scrap material. However, this could also refer to the children actually seeing sexual acts for the first time including that between their parents, which they had not witnessed prior to the demolition. The reality probably lies somewhere in the middle. The increased vulnerability of the women and their insecurity has led them into more illicit relationships.

15 per cent of the respondents said that rape cases were on the increase. One of the respondents herself was raped a year after the demolition.

Sexual experimentation among the boys seemed to have increased after the demolition – though how much of this is due to the boys growing up is uncertain. For instance, some of them reported seeing blue films together, then fondling each other, some reported having witnessed their friends experimenting. Boys were also subject to sexual exploitation. This ranged from being asked by customers to procure girls for them, being verbally abused, to being abused by older men and women. Elder boys and prostituted women send them to buy alcohol, food, cigarette, chewing tobacco etc. One boy of 18 said that a lady bar-owner whose husband was abroad used to take him and other young boys to her home, give them liquor to drink and sexually abuse them.

Instances of gambling and alcoholism among the boys also increased after the demolition.

## **Economic pressures after demolition**

Regarding economic pressure to earn after the demolition, there seemed to be more pressure on the girls than the boys. While only three boys (15 per cent) said that they felt there was pressure on them from their families to earn, 17 girls (33 per cent) felt this pressure from the families. However, from the interviews it is not clear how much of this was self-imposed. This is not unusual in families where the woman is the main earning member and the rest of the family is dependent on her earnings. It is not surprising that the girls felt that they should contribute. As one 13-year-old studying in Class 7 said, “I enjoy going to school. But after the demolition I started feeling guilty that my mother had to work much harder. Previously she used to ragpick in the area, but after the demolition she had to go much further away. She would leave early in the morning and return late at night. Since my father drinks heavily and has never contributed to the household, I felt I should contribute since my brothers and sisters are too small. So now I also go with my mother after I return from school. I feel good that I can help with some expenses, but I don’t know how much longer I can manage both my studies and work.”

All the families (of the children) interviewed were affected by the demolition in terms of loss of property and/or income sources. Economic pressures of the families increased and also resulted in other changes, including changes in the family structure and functions of the family members. In 34 per cent of the cases there were changes in the family structure, where one or more members either left the state or went to stay elsewhere or where the family joined their relatives or where the husband/*mard* left the wife to go back to the village, while the wife continued to prostitute or earn a living in other ways. The roles of the family members and consequent relationships also changed either because one of the parents, who was employed earlier, were now out of work, or because the children had to give up their studies to help the parents to earn, or because some children who had dropped out of school prior to the demolition were now earning.

Most of the respondents did not have much to say regarding security provided by the police. From those who did respond to the question (30 per cent of girls and 40 per cent of boys) there were mixed responses. Some said that police presence in the area had increased after the demolition; others said that it had decreased. By and large, they felt that the police did not work for the poor, but protected the *gharwallis* and pimps. They also felt that the police tried to get money from their mothers (who were in prostitution) and from customers found wandering about in the area. A few said that the police security was adequate and that they helped to settle family quarrels. A couple of male respondents had got beaten by the police for gambling and pimping.

## **Support received after demolition**

Most of the respondents said they received some form of support. This included

food, clothes and medical care, which they received from Arz and different individuals and organizations immediately after the demolition. Once the initial crisis was over, they continued to get help from Arz in the form of clothes, books, school material, tuitions, participation in 'exposure' visits, school visits, counselling, etc.

## **Findings and Recommendation**

The Convention On The Rights Of The Child adopted by the General Assembly at UN in 1989 intends to protect and promote the wellbeing of children in our society. The UN Convention provides for right to survival, right to protection, right to development and right to participation.

Article 3 of the UN Convention provides that all actions concerning children, whether undertaken by public or private social welfare institutions, courts of law, administrative authorities or legislative bodies the interest of the child shall be of prime consideration.

Article 6 of the UN Convention, Clause (2) clearly states that state parties shall ensure, to the maximum extent possible, the survival and development of the child.

Article 27 (1) states that parties should recognize the right of every child to a standard of living adequate for the child's physical, mental, spiritual, moral and social development.

The Constitution of India, under article 39 (f) provides that the state shall direct its policy towards ensuring that children are given opportunity and facilities to develop in a healthy manner in conditions of freedom and dignity and that children and youth are protected against exploitation and moral and material abandonment.

International and state laws declare that children have the right to a family environment conducive to proper physical and mental development, to go to school, to play, to get health care and adequate nutrition. But reality seems quite far. There was gross violation of child rights not only during the entire process of displacement at Baina but even today children don't have access to sanitary facilities, schools, playgrounds and health care services. The children do encounter exploitations in day-to-day life. They are not being protected from anti-social elements in the community where they reside. Children are being used for gambling, begging, stealing and other criminal activities. For the girls, the situation is worse. One section of the girls finds itself socially isolated and mainly confined to home in order to perform domestic tasks. Another section, suffers verbal, physical and sexual abuse while at work primarily due to the lack of protection.

Following the clauses provided in the UN Convention and the Constitution of India, the state has provided for the protection (through the enactment of various legislations and policies) of the rights of the child. But the displacement of families

from Baina seems to be an extraordinary example of how the legal provisions are blatantly violated by those who are supposed to ensure the protection of the people, especially children.

### **Recommendations**

- The state should ensure that its actions do not violate the rights of the child.
- The Goa State Government, in consultation with NGO's should come up with a special programme for the victims of Baina demolition. The programme should include – economic rehabilitation, shelter, recreation, psychiatric and counselling services, health, protection, education, etc.

Chapter V

## *Impact of Demolition on Brothel-keepers*

- *The* prostitution business in Baina continues to function due to a strong nexus between bar-owners, pimps, brothel keepers and room owners.
- The police provides its tacit support by overlooking the nexus.
- No police person is posted at any of the soliciting points.
- Functioning of the bars in the area has caused in the increase of prostitution activities in the area.
- Brothel keepers and pimps do not allow girls to give up prostitution and opt for rehabilitation.
- Most of the brothel-keepers who moved out of Baina to other places are those whose rooms got demolished during the Baina demolition.
- Brothel-keepers whose rooms got demolished were unable to set up business again, as Arz with the assistance and participation of the community memers in Baina ensured that they are not given rooms on rent for prostiution activities in Baina. But these brothel-keepers visit Baina on occasions, such as during elections, religious festivals, etc.
- The brothel-keepers who continue to operate in Baina are those who still have rooms in Baina or have relatives there.
- Some women who were previously brothel-keepers in Baina have started prostituting after the demolition.
- A majority of the brothel-keepers continue to be in the same business.
- During the demolition the brothel-keepers were allowed to go away with their girls/women; this helped them to set up their business again in other parts of Goa and the neighbouring states.

### **I. Brothel-Keepers Operating In Baina:**

Information on brothel-keepers was gathered mainly from the girls/women who were prostituting for them; as such the data is rather skimpy. While information was available that 14 brothel-keepers are operating from Baina after the demolition, only sketchy information was obtained about some of them. Some brothel-keepers left the area after the demolition, taking the girls along with them so that they could be prostituted elsewhere. A few of these returned to Baina later and continued to prostitute the girls there.

#### *Demographic profile*

Most of the *gharwallis* were above the age of 40, except for two who were aged 23 and 30 years respectively. Ten were from Karnataka and four from Andhra Pradesh. Most of the *gharwallis* (8) were unmarried, six were married. Regarding



educational status, apart from one who had completed Class 6 and another who had completed Class 1, the rest had received no formal education. All the brothel-keepers were fairly well-off, though their exact income could not be determined. There did not seem to be a correlation between any of the factors except that the younger *gharwallis* were both from Andhra Pradesh.

One thing is clear – there has been a substantial drop in the number of brothel-keepers in the area after the demolition. One alarming fact which was evident was that the remaining ones engaged in more vicious exploitation of the girls.

#### *Modus operandi*

Each of the brothel-keepers had a number of girls/women working under them. This ranged from 1 to 7, except for one brothel-keeper who had 15 girls. Interestingly, there appeared to be no correlation between economic status and number of women. The patterns of trafficking, prostituting the girls, soliciting, etc. remained largely the same with all the brothel-keepers. All the brothel-keepers had bought the girls from some middlemen or women or the husband of the girl. In some cases the girls could move from one brothel-keeper to another; these were usually the older, more established girls.

A majority of the brothel-keepers had not taken on new girls after the demolition. Some of the girls/women were dedicated; others who were not, were from Karnataka and AP.

All the brothel-keepers operated in the same fashion as they did prior to the demolition. In some cases the girls are kept separately in a room, while the brothel-keeper stays at home with her family. This is especially in the case of the married brothel-keepers. Most of the unmarried brothel-keepers have the girls either staying with them (the ones who do not have *mards*), or they live in one room while the other rooms are given out for prostitution. Some girls stay in their rented rooms with their *mards*.

Either the girls solicit or pimps get the customers. Some customers approach the girls directly. The girls are taken to a brothel room or bar or lodge once the deal with the customer is complete.

Most of the *gharwallis* send the girls out of Baina, if there are not enough customers in Baina. This has increased after the demolition. The places where they are sent include Margao, Panjim, and other places in Goa as well as Mysore, Chennai. As discussed in the section on prostituted women, they are more vulnerable in such situations.

#### *Reasons for working under brothel-keepers*

There are various reasons why the girls prefer to work under brothel-keepers. They are protected during police raids. If there is any problem with the police, they have some security in terms of food, shelter, medical aid and monetary

support, especially in the case of emergency. The girls prefer to live with brothel-keepers in Baina as they feel safe and are protected from both the police and goons. Most of the brothel-keepers also have political links as well as the support of various local pimps in Baina. Most of the girls have experienced the risk of working without the support of a brothel-keeper, especially when they have been sent out to other areas to prostitute.

While the girls are aware that they are being exploited when working under the brothel-keeper, the advantages outweigh the disadvantages for those who continue. Further, most of them are indebted to the brothel-keepers as they have to repay loans which have been taken at high rates of interest. The disadvantages of working under a brothel-keeper are that much of their earnings are taken by the brothel-keeper, they are sometimes abused, deprived of food, and forced to have sex with customers even when they are ill or unwilling to do so.

The money is paid directly by the client to the brothel-keeper. If they are on their own, in places other than Baina, the girls hand over their earnings to the brothel-keeper on their return. While on dates, a percentage of the earnings has to be given to the lodge owners and pimps or waiters. On an average, the brothel-keeper gets about 50 per cent of the earnings of the girls working under them. The commission of the brothel-keeper is more if she provides accommodation as well, i.e., if the girl stays in the brothel-keeper's house.

Goa lost an opportunity to curb the problem of trafficking after the High Court judgment in 2004 regarding Baina. The State failed to act against the traffickers as directed by the Court, as a result of which the perpetrators went scot-free. Today we have a situation wherein the traffickers from Baina continue to be in the business in Baina as well as involved in commercial sexual exploitation in different parts of Goa and outside Goa.

### Perpetrators operating in baina

#### I. *Brothel keepers: Girls and Women prostituting under them.*

<i>Name</i>	<i>Address</i>	<i>Modus Operandi</i>	<i>Other Imp Details</i>
<i>Ms. Tarava Lambani</i>	<i>Tarava Galli, Opp Sulabh Toilet, Baina Beach, Baina.</i>	<i>She has girls and women prostituting under her. She also rents her room to be used as a brothel.</i>	<i>Convicted for prostituting minors.</i>
<i>Ms. Karibassava</i>	<i>Mabadevi Galli, opp Sulabh Toilet</i>	<i>She has girls and women prostituting under her. She also rents her room to be used as a brothel.</i>	<i>Her elder sister Mabadevi was convicted for prostituting minors.</i>
<i>Ms. Shayamala</i>	<i>Shayamala Galli, Opp Sulabh Toilet.</i>	<i>She has 4 girls and women prostituting under her.</i>	

II. **Room Owners:** Renting rooms for commercial sexual activities

<b>Name</b>	<b>Address</b>
<i>Ms. Laxmi Chandravva</i>	<i>Opp. Cosmo Bar/ August Bar.</i>
<i>Ms. Savitri</i>	<i>Near Moti Paan Shop, Ice Factory Galli (The room is rented by Savitri and she provides this room to girls to use as a brothel on commission basis).</i>
<i>Ms. August Bar Owner/ Cosmo Bar</i>	<i>He allows the customers visiting his bar to use the adjacent room as a brothel.</i>
<i>Ms. Padma- August Galli</i>	<i>She prostitutes and also rents her room for prostitution activities. Her son Mr. Gajannan is a police constable.</i>
<i>Ms. Mehboob Bi</i>	<i>Near Ice Factory.</i>
<i>Ms. Nagu</i>	<i>Behind Anthony Bar.</i>

III. **Pimps:** Soliciting customers for the girls

<b>Name</b>
<i>Mr. Veerbbadriya Heeremath</i>
<i>Mr. Abhimanyu (Pujari/Madarasi)</i>
<i>Mr. Badshah Sheikh</i>
<i>Mr. Krishna</i>
<i>Mr. Francis (Gular)</i>
<i>Mr. Salim</i>
<i>Mr. Vinod (Chuha)</i>
<i>Mr. Rajesh (Uchaa)</i>

**Soliciting points in Baina:**

1. Near Marina Bar/Water Sports Point.
2. At Nitin Bar & Restaurant.
3. Near Moti Paan Shop, Ice Factory Road.
4. At Cosmo/August Bar, Near Ice Factory.
5. Near Sulabh Toilet.

II. **Brothel Keepers operating outside Baina:-**

The brothel keepers previously working in Baina before the demolition and now after the demolition operating outside Baina, either in Goa or outside Goa are those who either lost their houses during the demolition or were staying in rented premises.

The information about the brothel-keepers was received from the victims residing in Baina but visiting other parts of Goa for commercial sexual activities and from the pimps operating in Baina.

***i). Brothel- Keepers operating outside Baina but in Goa:***

The brothel keepers who continue to operate in Goa are those who have relatives in Goa and have contacts with the locals who provide them protection. In fact most of these brothel-keepers were assisted by these protectors to shift their business from Baina and set up business in other parts of Goa.

*Modus operandi*

Most brothel-keepers have recruited new girls due to fear of identification by the police and local administration. These girls stay in flats hired by the brothel keepers. The brothel – keepers get customers with the assistance of the hotel and lodge staff, old customers and pimps operating in Baina.

Most of these victims are sent to hotels and lodges or to the flats in Goa. The pimp contacts the brothel keeper on her mobile phone informing her about the customer, the brothel-keeper in turn sends a vehicle to pick up the girl from her house and drop her at the destination. The vehicle again collects the girl and drops her back at her house.

The girls are sent to different parts of Goa, but South Goa is their main geographical area of operation.

<i>Sl. no.</i>	<i>Name</i>	<i>Place of Operation</i>
1.	<i>Parvati</i>	<i>Margao</i>
2.	<i>Margao Devi</i>	<i>Margao</i>
3.	<i>Sushi</i>	<i>Birla</i>

***ii). Brothel Keepers operating outside Goa:***

After the demolitions a majority of the brothel-keepers shifted to the red-light districts outside Goa. These brothel keepers took with them the girls being prostituted by them at the time of the demolition. They also recruited others working under other brothel-keepers who had decided to give-up brothel keeping. They paid the brothel-keepers and bought the girls. They also recruited girls from Baina who, after the demolition, were unable to earn in Baina or Goa and were willing to move out of Goa.

The brothel-keepers shifted from Baina to Pune, Mysore and Hubli.

<i>Sl. no.</i>	<i>Name</i>	<i>Place of Operation</i>
1.	<i>Ms Jaffer Laxmi</i>	<i>Pune, Maharashtra</i>
2.	<i>Ms Anita</i>	<i>Pune, Maharashtra</i>
3.	<i>Ms Hotel Laxmi</i>	<i>Pune, Maharashtra</i>
4.	<i>Ms Shakeela</i>	<i>Pune, Maharashtra</i>
5.	<i>Ms Verlaxmi</i>	<i>Pune, Maharashtra</i>
6.	<i>Ms Neelava</i>	<i>Pune, Maharashtra</i>

7.	<i>Ms Roshan</i>	<i>Hubli, Karnataka</i>
8.	<i>Ms Kamala</i>	<i>Hubli, Karnataka</i>
9.	<i>Ms Sapna</i>	<i>Mysore, Karnataka</i>

**Recommendation:**

- The State Government should form a task force headed by the Sub-Divisional Magistrate, Mormugao; the force should comprise of the police, NGO's, CBO's and victims of trafficking. A detailed investigation of persons involved in commercial sexual exploitation of women in Baina should be conducted. This should be followed by action against the traffickers, the sealing of brothels and economic rehabilitation of victims of commercial sexual exploitation.
- Information (pertaining to trafficking for CSE in other states) should be shared with the concerned State Government for action.

*A Research Report by*

**Arz**

*Plot no. 71. Next to ESI Dispensary.*

*Sancoale Industrial Estate,*

*Zuari Nagar,*

*Vasco,*

*Goa - 403 726*

*Phone : 0832-2555619*

*Fax : 0832-2555 446*

*[www.arzindia.org](http://www.arzindia.org)*

*Editing, design & layout: IDEAS M&A, Kolkata Cell: 98317 02580*

## *An Introduction to Groupe Développement*

*G*roupe Développement – Acting for Life, is an international agency that works towards empowerment of those in poverty, with a commitment to protect children and adolescents from abuse and exploitation. Its Child Protection department supports local NGOs across 20 countries of the world., often consortiums and networks on alternative livelihood and/or child protection programmes and works in partnership towards sustainability of those actions. In South Asia, the organization supports over 85 NGOs and community based organizations in India, Bangladesh, Pakistan, Nepal and Sri Lanka. Financial support for projects it implements are drawn from European and international public co-financing agencies, including the European Commission. It also implements projects in close partnership with ECPAT Luxembourg. In addition to public funding, 30 percent of the funds are raised by various foundations, corporate partners and individuals-- to ensure civil society leverage to make a greater difference with their participation.



**Groupe Développement – Active for Life**